

Income Generating Projects Implementation: Learning from the State Universities and Colleges' Best Practices for a Sustainable Extension Programs for Children

Georgina A. Marcos

*Zamboanga State College of Marine Sciences and Technology
Zamboanga City, Philippines*

Abstract

One of the mandates of HEIs is to formulate Income Generating Projects (IGPs) that will help financially augment its operations as well as for sustaining its extension programs. This study investigated the best practices of Income Generating Projects implementers among State Universities and Colleges in the Philippines in terms of monitoring, evaluation, procurement and supply management, and governance and program management. In measuring the IGP performance, this study considered the revenues of the model Income Generating Projects (IGPs) of the participating SUCs. This study used the methodological triangulation methodology in improving the internal validity of the research findings. Thematic analysis was used to analyze qualitative data, which were compared and converged to discover areas of similarity and complementarity. The participating SUCs shared many best practices that are worth emulating especially by SUCs who do not have their IGPs or could serve as their model. It is also recommended that extension programs should focus among the youngest members of the communities because many studies proved that early childhood education and intervention yield many long-term benefits for children.

Keywords: *Income Generating Projects (IGPs), State Universities and Colleges, Best Practices, Sustainable, Extension Programs, Children*

Introduction

In the Philippines, higher education is provided through different degree programs referred to as courses. These courses are offered by a diverse range of colleges and universities, which are collectively known as higher education institutions or HEIs. The Commission on Higher Education (CHED) is responsible for regulating and overseeing these institutions. HEIs can be classified as either colleges or universities, and can be either public or private, as well as secular or religious. According to CHED's records as of August 2010, there were 1,573 private HEIs and 607 public HEIs in the country.

One of the mandates of HEIs is to formulate Income Generating Projects (IGPs) that will help financially augment its operations. In 2011, Omukoba, Simatwa, and Ayodo explained that implementing Income Generating Projects (IGPs) in schools is essential to address macroeconomic changes, especially in Private Higher Institutions (PHEIs), without resorting to increasing tuition fees that would burden parents. Republic Act 8292 allows state colleges or universities to engage in profitable business ventures for the growth and management of their economic assets, and the generated income should be utilized for their development and strengthening. Moreover, the Commission on Higher Education (CHED) encourages State Universities and Colleges (SUCs) to participate in "Income Generating Projects (IGPs)" to supplement their budget.

As a result, Republic Act 8292, often known as the Higher Education Modernization Act of 1997, expressly encourages State Universities and Colleges to engage in income-generating projects to supplement limited resources and eventually become self-sufficient. Because of

government budget cuts to public education, SUCS must increase their financial capabilities. Final support for the above controversy has been emphasized by Eid (2009), who concludes that two decades of project management standards have failed to address the sustainability agenda to this concern seriously. Regrettably, the remaining 80-90 percent of HEI educators are primarily concerned with instruction and perhaps some extension activities. As a result, a new approach to strategic management is required because the ability to translate strategy into action is the most important skill in any academic IGP business. This is the reason why the researcher's intention is to present a proposed sustainability model for Income Generating Projects (IGPs) after having determined the relationship between the capacity level among IGP implementers and IGP performance in terms of revenues among the SUCs in ZAMBASULTA area.

Many HEIs are very resourceful in creating their IGPs in which its proceeds are basically used to help in the extension programs that they gave to their beneficiary community. Higher education institutions (HEIs) have a responsibility to provide extension programs that contribute to achieving development goals. It is crucial for academic institutions to monitor and assess the impact of their community programs at the grassroots level. Additionally, HEIs should also address the urgent needs of the youth population.

In planning for the extension programs, careful analysis of the research results is being done to make sure that Universities can give contribution and help in the solution on the issues in the academe and communities that need to be addressed. In doing these, faculty are encouraged to look for partners and other stakeholders that have the same vision on community development.

Parents and caregivers have the primary role of shaping a child's development and academic achievement. They can play a significant part in preparing children for school by nurturing their early math, science, and pre-literacy skills. To help parents and caregivers in this aspect, extension programs for early childhood education are conducted to equip them with the necessary tools and knowledge to improve their children's skills in these critical areas. These programs empower parents and caregivers to become the best resources and advocates for their children's education. Aside from these, it is also important to make sure that financial resources to support the extension programs have to be strengthened to ensure its sustainability. The focus is on supporting women and reducing poverty by assisting single mothers in the community to have a means of earning to support themselves while pursuing their diploma. Despite the government's UniFast law that provides free tuition and miscellaneous fees, some still drop out of school because they require more than just tuition assistance. They also need support for their daily needs, such as food. To address this issue, Income Generating Projects (IGPs) can serve as a vital link between the academic institution and the community.

It is in this premise that the researcher was motivated to pursue this study in order to share to other Universities who are also conducting extension programs the best practices in the implementation of the Income Generating Projects (IGPs).

Related Literature and Studies

Theoretical Framework

This study is based on theory of Organizational Effectiveness (Balduck and Buelens 2008). This was used to assess the IGPs' longterm viability, considering elements/factors such as management capability, financial management, marketing, and technical operations. According to Balduck and Buelens (2008), there is no single model of organizational sustainability and performance that fits all organizations. The issue of organizational sustainability and effectiveness, according to Balduck and Buelens (2008), revolves around four key approaches: internal process approach, system resource approach, goal approach, and strategic constituency approach. These are effective and efficient strategies that are dependent on the type of situation that may emerge. The internal process approach focuses on the transformation process and

determines how much of the resources are formally employed to provide services or manufacture items (Schermerhorn et. al. 2004). The term "effectiveness" refers to an organization's internal health and efficiency, as well as the existence of internal processes and procedures. Members of an effective and long-lasting organization are fully integrated into the system, which runs smoothly. The members' connection is built on trust, honesty, and goodwill. This method will focus on the study's managerial capacity component.

The system resource approach considers the organization's ability to gather necessary resources from external surroundings to ensure its long-term viability and effectiveness (Schermerhorn et. al. 2004). This approach's dominant viewpoint is that every aspect of an organization's activity has an effect or influence on all other aspects (Mullins, 2008). To gauge sustainability and effectiveness in the system resource approach, input and output measurements are preferred due to their quantitative nature. However, such measurements may not reveal the complete performance story since novel ideas and discoveries do not always result in immediate observable impacts. It is possible for academic and research organizations to not achieve outstanding outcomes even after long-term support. This approach will be utilized to examine the financial management aspect of the study. On the other hand, the goal approach concentrates on outputs to identify the primary operational objectives, such as profit, innovation, product quality, and marketing. (Schermerhorn et al. 2004).

One of the most basic assumptions of the goal approach is that the precise goals should be widely agreed upon, and the people involved should be dedicated to achieving them. This method will be used to address the study's marketing component.

The strategic constituency approach focuses on the impact of the organization on its primary stakeholders and their interests (Schermerhorn et al., 2004). In this approach, sustainability and effectiveness are determined by satisfying the needs of all the organization's strategic constituencies. The strategic constituency encompasses the operational strategies and all individuals associated with the company, including customers of its products or services, resource providers, primary supporters, organization dependents, and facilitators of the organization's output. This approach assumes an exhaustive attitude toward sustainability and effectiveness and evaluates the factors both in the environment and within the organization. The technical operation relative to the sustainability of IGPs will be taken into consideration in this approach.

Another theory which this study is anchored Stakeholder Theory (Freeman 2005) while the Stakeholder Theory will address socio-economic problems. The stakeholder theory challenges the idea that shareholder interests should take precedence and suggests that project management should prioritize the interests of all stakeholders. The theory assumes that values are an essential and explicit aspect of project management, and that project managers should communicate the value that they create to unite the project's main stakeholders. If stakeholders receive what they anticipate from a project, they are likely to continue their involvement in the future. Since stakeholders can significantly impact project success, project leaders should consider the interests of all stakeholders, including employees, customers, communities, and government officials, when making decisions and manage the project responsibly.

Gareis et al. (2009) advocate that project managers should make decisions that account for the interests of all stakeholders involved in a project, not only financial claimants. The socioeconomic component of the study will therefore be addressed by this theory. The study will commence on the identification of participating SUCs that will represent the ZAMBASULTA area. The next step is to coordinate with person in charge of the IGPs in the respective SUCs to determine which among the IGPs operated by the SUCs in the

ZAMBASULTA area has the highest financial capital and has been in operation for several years. Coordinating with the person in-charge of the IGPs in the identified SUCs will also help in the identification of the participants/respondents who are directly involved and knowledgeable about their respective IGPs. These participants will have to evaluate the influence of management capacity, financial management, marketing, socio economic concerns and technical operations on the sustainability of the income generating projects (IGPs) operated by the State Universities and Colleges (SUCs) in the ZAMBASULTA area. The ultimate output of this study will be the best practices that may be adopted for the sustainability of IGPs operated by SUCs in the ZAMBASULTA area.

Legal Basis for SUCs to Undertake IGPs

Legal support is necessary for the State Universities and Colleges (SUC) to engage in income-generating enterprises and obtain more funds for their support. Several legal enactments have been implemented for this purpose since 1979. One of these was the release of LOI No. 872 on June 8, 1979, which encouraged agricultural schools, colleges, and universities to participate in food production programs and allowed them to establish a Revolving Fund (RF) using the proceeds from the program. NBC 331 was also released on November 27, 1980, providing guidelines for implementing LOI 872 and prescribing rules and procedures for creating an RF from agricultural initiatives' earnings.

Several legal provisions were enacted to aid in the operation of national schools and government agencies in the Philippines. One such provision was LOI No. 1026, which was released on May 23, 1980. Another provision, COA Circular No. 84-239, was released on August 15, 1984, and mandated that government agencies follow uniform methods for recording, valuing, and reporting received or generated items. DBM Circular Letter No. 92-8 was also released on November 18, 1992, which recommended the creation of auxiliary service revolving funds (RF) in SUCs and the establishment of Fund 163. DBM Circular Letter No. 94-5 provided standards for the use of income and maintenance, development, and operation of various agencies' RFs.

NCC 75, which was released on March 1, 1995, established regulations and procedures for awarding honoraria to government officials and staff working on special projects. RA No. 8292, which was released in June 1997, granted the governing board of SUCs the authority to use existing resources to earn additional revenue. This law authorized the governing board to determine the use of school funds for any legitimate purpose necessary to achieve the University or College's goals. The General Appropriations Act FY 2000 (Sec. 4 of the General Provisions) allowed existing RFs to continue their operations, except for those stated under "use of income." RFs were considered self-perpetuating and self-liquidating.

Sustainability of IGPs

The approach to sustainability in income-generating projects (IGP) has evolved, and now encompasses the project life cycle, from design and planning to monitoring and evaluation, to ensure project sustainability (Norton 2010). To achieve this, various methods such as advocacy, fundraising, governance, leadership, and capacity building are required for project sustainability, emphasizing the importance of building capacity at the national and regional levels (Mutimba 2013). Sustainability of projects means that institutions supported through projects and their benefits are maintained and continued even after the project ends (IFAD, 2011). This definition of sustainability highlights a shift from the traditional emphasis on environmental concerns to economic and social development (IISD 2003). In recent years, there has been a growing focus on the design and implementation phases of projects to make them more successful and efficient (IFAD 2012). The idea of management practices to promote sustainability is becoming increasingly popular, as it is important to ensure the sustainability of livelihoods and poverty reduction (Eyben 2010). This approach emphasizes the long-term resilience of livelihoods, the management of available assets, and the ability to

manage shocks and stresses (Chambers and Conway 1992, as cited by Clarke and Oswald 2010).

However, recent studies have shown that the trend with sustainability is disappointing, as fewer projects are being sustained (TANGO International, 2008). This suggests that the costs incurred during implementation are not commensurate with the benefits received. In the field activities conducted in the Philippines and Vietnam, one of the most common constraints on sustainability was a lack of water. According to reports, risk analysis was conducted before project design, but there were no concrete risk management techniques. Moreover, there is inadequate consideration of contextual constraints such as a lack of infrastructure, leading to the emergence of unsustainable market-driven project designs.

Factors that significantly influence IGP sustainability

There are many factors that significantly influence IGP sustainability among State Colleges and Universities (SUCS) that tremendously impact institutional operations directly or indirectly, namely:

CHED Trends on IGP. In addition, it is worth noting that on January 15, 1999, CHED issued a call for research proposals from SUCs for Fiscal Year 1999, with the subtopic "Enhancing the Income-Generating Capability of Filipinos through the non-traditional and innovative means," directing on the promotion of Income Generation Projects (IGPs) among various government agencies, including SUCs. With this challenge, SUCs are now tasked with raising funds for continuous, effective, and efficient institutional development operations. Furthermore, as Florendo (2005) emphasizes, the need for IGP resource generation is driven by the following CHED trends, which appear to be mandates:

- 1) All institutions are experiencing rising operational costs, primarily due to inflation.
- 2) There are new technologies available that should be brought into the classroom, such as computers, video equipment, and so on.
- 3) Demand for services is increasing with an increase in population, and the minimum standards set by technical panels and accreditation standards of voluntary professional organizations require keeping up to certain norms.

As a result, according to Bermejo (2006), one of the CHED's main concerns is to develop and maintain excellence, relevance, and self-reliance in the SUCs. For institutional development to be sustainable, the institution must be able to discover ways and means to support it. The majority, if not all, of administrators, evaluate and use income-generating programs and projects as one of their options.

Extension Programs of the HEIs in the Philippines (paraphrased)

The term "extension" does not have a specific definition, but instead describes a constantly evolving process in rural areas, according to Oakley and Garforth (1997), as cited in the article. The term was coined during the nineteenth century in England, when the universities of Oxford and Cambridge sought to provide education for the expanding population beyond their walls (Jones & Garforth, 1997).

The Commission on Higher Education (CHED) originally defined extension services in the Philippines as the act of communicating, persuading, and helping specific target clientele to improve production, community and/or institutions, and the quality of life. Later, the definition was expanded to include the systematic transfer of technology, innovation, or information generated by HEIs and its partners to address specific developmental issues (CHED, 2008). Extension services are related to knowledge transmission, technology transfer, community services, community outreach, and community participation. However, a study of university cases from around the world found that knowledge transfer is mainly associated

with university-industry partnerships, while engagement is mainly linked to community or social development, services, and impact (Maassen et al., 2019).

Partnerships between HEIs and the community should be mutually beneficial. Research and technology-transfer activities by academics should have the potential to improve curriculum and pedagogy. Extension programs help students understand the importance of citizenship, and they add new ideas and perspectives to the academic process (Soska & Butterfield, 2013).

Quality school-age care programs have been acknowledged by educators for their benefits. As per Posner and Vandell (cited in National Association of Elementary School Principals, 1993), after-school programs can lead to enhanced self-esteem, social skills, and academic performance in children. In a national study of 76 Extension-supported school-age care programs across 16 states, Locklear, Riley, Steinberg, Todd, Junge, and McClain (1994) discovered that the youth participating in these programs supported by Cooperative Extension displayed improvements in social skills, academic performance, and a reduction in negative behavior problems. Similar outcomes were observed in a Baltimore program located in an inner-city (Allen, Brown, Finlay, 1994). Additionally, in a study conducted during 1985-86 of a New York City after-school program, Locklear (1992) found that the quality of homework and its completion had improved.

Research Question

What are the best practices of Income Generating Projects implementers among State Universities and Colleges in terms of:

- a. Monitoring;
- b. Evaluation;
- c. Procurement and supply management, and
- d. Governance and program management?

Methodology

This research is focused on investigating the best practices of the IGP implementers among State Universities and Colleges (SUCs) in the Zamboanga City, Basilan, Sulu, and Tawi-tawi provinces in the Philippines. The study was conducted during the second semester of the School Year 2021-2022. There were only six out of eight SUCs in ZAMBASULTA area that were included since there were two identified SUCs that do not have any existing IGP.

The study focused on measuring the performance of Income Generating Projects (IGPs) at participating SUCs by examining their revenues. The capacity level of IGP implementers was assessed based on specific constructs such as monitoring and evaluation, financial management, procurement and supply management, and governance and program management. To improve the internal validity of the research findings, the study used the methodological triangulation methodology, which involved conducting interviews with the Director for Production and Business Operations (DPBO) of SUCs or their equivalent, as well as holding a Focus Group Discussion (FGD) with selected IGP implementers from each SUC that was included in the study. The qualitative data obtained from these sources were analyzed using thematic analysis, with areas of similarity and complementarity being identified through comparison and convergence.

Results and Discussions

To determine the best practices and challenges of SUCs in the implementation of their IGPs in terms of monitoring, evaluation, procurement and supply management, and governance and program management, Focus Group Discussion involving the IGP implementers from the different SUCs was carried out. The name of the IGP implementers and the SUC where they belong were coded using numbers for the purpose of anonymity and pseudonym was also

used to hide the identity of the people involved or mentioned in the study. For the purpose of providing clarity in the discussion, the best practices and challenges are discussed comprehensively in different sections.

On the Best Practices in IGP Implementation.

Based on the results of the FGD, there are four (4) themes that emerged. These themes are aligned to the best practices that the implementers do in terms of (1) monitoring their IGP performance and operations, (2) evaluating IGP process and outcomes, (3) procure and supply managing and (4) governance and program managing. These themes are presented hereunder using the exact statements from the FGD participants and the implications were discussed to shed light on the possible contribution of these practices to IGP sustainability among SUCs in ZAMBASULTA.

On the Best Practices in Monitoring Project Performance and Operations.

Monitoring is an important element of IGP implementation to ensure that the IGP operations and activities are moving towards the target plans and goals. Based on the FGD data, there are four (4) subthemes that emerged under best practice in IGP monitoring, these were: effective planning, effective inventory scheme, excellent record keeping procedure and excellent accounting procedures. These themes are presented hereunder using the responses from the participants.

1. Effective Planning. Three participants from SUC 2, 3 and 5 said that they plan their IGP operations so that they can effectively monitor their operations to ensure that their daily IGP activities are geared towards achieving the planned target and outcome. Planning helps IGP implementers in monitoring their daily operations, and financial investments to enhance productivity and sustainability of IGPs.

The following were excerpts taken during the discussion:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *We have what we called the production advisory committee that sits with the different managers, looking into what are the plans first, the beginning of the year, we planned out last quarter, the last quarter of the year is the period where we prepared our NPPRE. During the time, when they submit the plan, NPPRE, we were already guided on what operations.*

SUC 3 Participant 2: *I think our best practices for the efficient and effective monitoring of the IGP operation, I think is planning of projects prior to the implementation since planning is the key to effective project implementation and efficient project implementation.*

SUC 5 Participant 1: *actually kasi ma'am, saamin, para at least, na ma'determine namin na meron kaming ma'income sa project. so saamin kasi ma'am sa agri, tina-timing namin ang aming planting. Oo kasi best practices yan siya. So hindi kami magtanim during hot season or dry season.*

These accounts suggest that the IGP implementers recognize the importance of effective planning as an element of monitoring. This is based on the principle that IGPs should operate based on what is planned. The plan provides the implementers with a roadmap to effectively monitor their IGP performance and daily operations. The study of Toperesu (2010) is consistent with the present finding, emphasizing the importance of planning at all stages of project implementation.

2. Effective Inventory Scheme. Results of the FGD revealed that four participants from SUC 2, 3 and 5 identified that effective inventory scheme is one of the best practices that they do to monitor the daily financial movement and supplies of their IGP operations. They keep the inventory record of their IGPs to monitor the needs to keep the IGP operations going. This was pertinently confirmed in the following statements:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *So pag mag compute kame ng income statement, we have to reflect from one hundred thousand ilang lang yung supplies nagamit. And yung ibang available supply, i-pack siya for the next operation. So, very careful din sila to maintain the inventory record on a monthly basis. Because these are the basis also sa pag monitor ng operation. So that everything is accounted for...*

SUC 2 Participant 4: *So the mode of monitoring, we prepare a ledger like for example ten sacks of rice, then may ledger kame, the moment na mabawasan like two kilos, ten kilos, may ledger kame kung ilang kilos yung nabawasan ano yung activity and then kalian yun nabawasan and corresponding with the amount na nabawasan.*

SUC 3 Participant 1: *In terms of supply office, we give materials like mga balde, so man monitor se kame, then we have process before ta kompra kun akel so ta pasa na cashier then in terms na ansina, ta puede kame man monitor kosa ta in and out na IGP.*

SUC 5 Participant 1: *So kung meron kaming cash-in, oo, so siyempre tine-take note namin yun, kung meron mga cash-in, what I mean is mga income, so ilan po baa ng mga na'produce namin, tine-take note po yun siya, ilang po ba ang nagastos namin, sa pagbili ng mga pambalot, gastos sa pagdala sa market, lahat po yun, ini-inventory.*

These statements imply that the IGP implementers from different SUCs recognized the importance of employing effective inventory scheme to monitor the flow of cash and materials in the project to facilitate the provision of the daily operation needs of the project and sustainability. This concurs with the study of Blas (2018) which revealed that one of the practices employed by IGP implementers in one of the SUCs in the Philippines is effective inventory scheme and provides for an up-to-date record keeping of all projects.

3. Excellent Record Keeping Procedure. Based on the FGD data, four (4) participants from SUC 2, 4 and 6 mentioned that they keep records of their IGP sales and supplies to keep track of their IGP operation daily. They also keep record of their daily IGP activities using different forms to monitor their supplies and ensure the successful operation of the project. This is supported by the direct quotes from the participants.

SUC 2 Participant 5: *isa sa ano namin, ginagawa talaga namin is to maintain the records. Especially with the leadership of our new team, we really try to maintain our records sa sales, factions, mortality and all other important information na kailangan doon sa project.*

SUC 2 Participant 1: *In addition, pagdating sa monitoring ng mga supplies, meron kaming templates, may mga forms kami, inventory forms, na nakalagay sa kani-kanilang mga unit. Like in the case of the U-Press, ilang bond paper, ilang materials na nagamit, everytime na may kukuha for printing, nire-reflect nila ang number of pieces na utilize. Kasi nag wi-withdraw sila on a periodic basis. Good for one year, naka-supply na sakanila lahat ng kailangan nila, but the utilization is being monitored.*

SUC 4 Participant 1: *Ah. I think ma'am, Ma'am Sonillo made mention about that one ma'am yung daily recording.*

SUC 6 Participant 3: *mga documentation na ginawa po rin namin, photocopy of the materials na related po doon sa financial matters ng review class.*

These statements imply that keeping the records of the financial, and operational aspects of the IGP is vital to attain sustainability. The SUCs must keep an accurate and complete record of their IGP operations and utilize monitoring data to address emerging challenges and problems and ensure that the project is operating based on the plans and targets of the institution. The study of Adora and Ultra (2020) concurs with the study's findings that SUCs practice safeguarding, using and archiving IGP transaction documents.

4. Excellent Accounting. The discussion also yielded data that supported in the importance ensuring accuracy in the accounting of project income and expenses. There were four (4) FGD participants from SUC 1, 2 and 3 who mentioned that one of the best monitoring practices that they do is checking the project income and expenses. To validate this, hereunder are the excerpts from the discussion:

SUC 1 Participant 2: *monitoringwe depend on the collection what collection is we declare as income so we do not monitor expenses because it is absorbed by the college for expenses except for those revolving funds we get from (inaudible) especially the production of the fish pond wherein we don't have much collection we don't have production.*

SUC 2 Participant 3: *it is important to monitor the income of the University Press. On my part I usually check it. I always ask the record from the accountant every quarter to be able to monitor properly the accounts.*

SUC 2 Participant 2: *So in our case, for CCE, since the CCE cash room is with the University cashier. We often just borrow to countercheck the reflected income. So we usually check what was put for a particular year, and then we monitor. .. the same as what we have in our petty cash, in our expenses, in what we earn...*

SUC 3 participant 2: *We are monitoring it against the actual collection given to us by the accounting unit so based on that we are also programmed for that collection in terms of expenses..*

The responses of the participants imply that checking the project income and expenses is an important monitoring activity that contribute to project sustainability. This means that by checking the project expenses and income, implementers can monitor if the expenses are according to what is planned and programmed. This also aid the implementers in checking the financial status of the projects to ensure that the target gain is achieved. The study of Adora and Ultra (2020) also concurs with this, revealing SUCs practice keeping and recording of accounting transactions.

On the Best Practices in Evaluating the IGP Process and Outcome

An important part of project implementation is evaluation. To guarantee that all actions and achievements are focused on reaching the desired goals and ensuring sustainability, every project must be reviewed. Policy compliance, feedback utilization, and open communication were the three (3) subthemes that emerged from the FGD data under best practices in IGP process and outcomes evaluation. Using the responses from the participants, these themes are shown below.

1. Policy Compliance. From the analysis of the qualitative data from the interview, data revealed that two (2) FGD participants from SUC 2 and 5 mentioned that they evaluate the outcomes and process of their IGPs using the established guidelines, policies and procedures. This is supported by the following statements from the participants:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *So there must be a system, policies and procedures must be in place, because you cannot evaluate when there is no criteria to be used for evaluation.*

SUC 5 Participant 3: *So far ma'am, it's okay. Okay naman. Ahh sa mga production namin, sa mga projects namin. Pero iniimplement namin sa ano, sa tamang procedure, ang income namin. Base sa ng ano ng college.*

The statements imply that the IGP implementers believe that the sustainability of IGPs can be achieved by evaluating the project process and outcomes based on the established plans, policies, procedures, and guidelines. This means that establishing the IGP policies and guidelines are important to ensure that the implementers are implementing accurate and objective evaluation of the project process and outcomes. This agrees with the study of Adora and Ultra (2020) which emphasized that SUCs in the Philippines have detailed internal policy, rules and instructions describing the operational work procedures of IGPs.

2. Utilization of Costumer Feedback. As a business enterprise, school IGP must also consider the voice and feedback of their costumers and clientele. This is what the implementers from SUC 2 has been implementing to improve their services and sustain the operations of their IGP. Below are excerpts from the discussion involving the implementers from SUC 2:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *it is also, grounded on the customer satisfaction...In terms of changing the behavior of newly hired faculty and staff, they undergo some training and seminar. We capacitate them, because, when you say customer satisfaction, siyempre studyante, tignan nila ang quality ng amin instruction and attitude ng faculty and staff serving the students. Not only in terms of product but also services.*

SUC 2 Participant 2: *... we monitor the evaluation feedback of our participants per year. We make it a point that each year, we increase the customer satisfaction of 2%. So in that case, we may know whether we are performing...*

These responses imply that the implementers from SUC 2 utilized costumer feedback as on of their strategies to effectively evaluate their IGP process and outcomes. This indicates that the utilization of customer feedback provides a substantial information that will help in evaluating the strengths and weakness of the project. Further, maintaining the strengths and addressing weaknesses of the project will aid in achieving project sustainability. This is in line with Karna and Junnonen's (2005) research, which found that feedback information is also a vehicle for exchanging knowledge about experiences and good solutions, and thus functions as a part of the knowledge mechanism and learning process. As a result, one of the most important aspects of project implementation is feedback.

3. Open Communication. Constant communication between IGP implementers and stakeholders also plays an important role in ensuring project sustainability. The qualitative data analysis shows that two (2) FGD participants from SUC 2 and 5 said that they communicate with their IGP workers and implementers to get feedback and evaluate the operation and status of their projects. The following are the direct quotes form the discussion participants:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *you must know how to communicate. Because you are dealing with customers, customers are always right, diba sinasabi natin. But we always assure them before the food is being served, may nagtaste. These are the things and practices that we really adopted. So that's part of communication... we are doing a quarter meeting. Quarter meeting in the IGP under my unit before, I have to call the production advisory committee.*

SUC 5 Participant 1: *I see to it na nakakausap ko ang aming workers. I have three workers, who do the activities in the farm. So, at the same time, gaya nga ng sabi ni Dr. rayhan kanina, china-challenge namin sila, because doon ga po sila kumukuha ng kanilang source.*

The participant's statements imply that constant communication between ang among workers and implementers is important to keep the project on operating. This means that IGP implementers must maintain constant communication with the people involved in the project to obtain data that will help in evaluating the project and improve the process and outcomes to attain sustainability. The findings agree with Bucata and Rizescu (2017) who stressed that communication and management are complimentary disciplines and important business factors for success.

On the Best Practices in Procurement and Supply Management

The IGPs will not be able to function without the necessary materials and equipment. In this regard, implementers' procurement and supply management procedures play a critical role in ensuring that the resources required to keep the IGP running. Under best procurement and supply management, two (2) subthemes developed based on the FGD data: prompt procurement and resourcefulness. Using the responses from the participants, these themes are shown and discussed below.

1. Prompt Procurement. Procurement of materials and equipment should always follow legal procedures. Sometimes, these procedures delay the request of the needed materials and hampers the daily operations of the IGPs. The IGP implementers from SUCs 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 employ prompt procurement as strategy to ensure that the needed materials and equipment for the IGP operation are in place and available. Responses included during the conduct of the discussion are the following:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *So doon sa procurement, identify mo ang mga needs na iproprocure, kasi yan ang requirement, hindi mo pwedeng hindi sundin. Kaya nga in takestime. Ang number of days, may mga PhilGeps pa yan may mga posting pa yan kaya, sa aming manual, Makita mo doon ang procedure at saka flow...*

SUC 3 Participant 1: *tan anticipate ya le daan, so tan procure ya le early which is good kasi in case needed tali ya dayun supplies for the IGP. Sabe ya kase sila kimodo de el bidding for their projects so earlier palang tan early procurement ya sila*

SUC 3 Participant 2: *supply..... binebenta nalang naming siya para makadagdag for the IGP, and also early procurement for those projects that's all ma'am*

SUC 6 Participant 3: *bago po kame nag start ng review class, ang ginawa po namin is naglist muna kame ng materials na kailangan namin doon sa review class and then nag proceed po kame agad sa canvassing po.*

The response in the discussion implies that prompt request and procurement of IGP materials and equipment is an essential element of IGP sustainability. This means that implementer must anticipate the requirements of the project and exercise promptness in the request of the needed materials to contribute the continuous operation of the project. This agrees with the study of Borges de Araújo, Alencar, and Miranda Mota, 2017 who stressed the importance of selecting the right supplier for an assignment, as well as evaluating this supplier's performance while the contract is being implemented since it plays an important role in ensuring a good project outcome.

3.Resourcefulness. The project operation may encounter several financial challenges that may affect the IGP operation of SUCs. In addressing this problem, the IGP implementers of SUCs 2 and 3 are resourceful enough by trying alternative strategies that will provide the needed materials in the project to operate. This was aptly expressed in the following statements:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *Yung resourcefulness, hahanap ka ng resources kung saan, manghiram or whatever supplies and materials ang kailangan mo kasi training na, so, that's the work always of the director or the manager. They should know what it is to be resourceful... Meron kaming petty cash, we are required, we handle cash advances, may petty cash in the case of food service, bibili ka ng mga gulay, mga perishable products na hindi siya pwede idaan sa box. So that is alternative mode of procurement, merong petty cash na binibigay saamin.*

SUC 2 Participant 4: *we are given parang cash advance and we procure that for the important ingredients that are non-perishable.*

SUC 3 Participant 1: *For supply, el best practice is once receiving el PO tan follow up ki follow up ya kun el supplier, para puede ya man help kun el IGP. Like for the ID, hinde ya kame ta alcanza na delivery terms disuyu so if possible ta puede ya kame man receive supplies na IGP*

These accounts on the importance of resourcefulness among IGP implementers to provide the financial requirements to keep the project operating. This means that when the implementers are resourceful, they tend to contribute more on sustaining the IGP of their institution. This is in line with the study of Nandamuri (2013) who found out from his study that entrepreneurial resourcefulness is a significant role in the project or business success.

On the Best Practices in Governance and Program Management

To guarantee that project policies are defined and executed to achieve sustainability, project governance and program management are critical. This means that the implementers' leadership style, professional attributes, and entrepreneurial talents must all be taken into account, as they play a critical part in the project's overall operation and success. Managers' values, planning and working ahead of time, and supporting decisions with data from consultations were the three (3) sub-themes that emerged from the FGD data under best practices in governance and program management. Using the responses from the participants, these themes are shown and discussed below.

1.Managers' Values. The project implementers' values also play a critical role in the success of any project. This means that it is important for the top management to consider the person's commitment and credibility in hiring implementers and workers in the project. Instilling the values of commitment and integrity among the people involve in the IGP operation should be the top priority in governing and managing the project as it plays a significant role in the project sustainability. This was pertinently confirmed by the following statements:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *...and always, you are 24/7 are your service. Sunday mag report kasi Monday na ang training. Everything should be in place before the start of the training. They are really committed. Nagreklamo man yan sila sa likod pero pag nasa harap, they really try their best to provide the service needed.*

SUC 2 Participant 2: *The core value of being HONEST in doing your work. Trust and confidence binigay sayo ang buong responsibility for you to work hard para maging, para mag generate ng income.*

SUC 4 Participant 4: *pero I believe that they have the heart, they have the skills kaya lang hindi gaano ang sustainability ng aming project.*

These statements imply that one of the ingredients of a sustainable IGP is having implementers who manifest excellent work ethics of commitment and values of honesty and integrity. This means that the top management must be very careful in selecting the people that will compose the school's IGP implementers as this serves as one of the determining factors' of the project success and sustainability. This is consistent with the findings of Adora and Ultra (2020) which revealed that the SUCsin Eastern Visayas Philippines has been observing commitment and ethical values in the operation of the IGPs.

1.Planning and Working in Advance. Planning is one of the important activities needed to ensure the effective implementation of IGPs. This means that project implementers should plan ahead of time to anticipate potential risk and problems of the project and support the sustainability. This is supported by the by FGD data where three respondents mentioned that planning and working ahead of time is one of the governance and program management practices that they perform.

This was pertinently confirmed in the following statements:

SUC 2 Participant 1: *Ikaw na unit head ka, either director or manager, you should always work in advance. Alam na alam mo na kalian ito gamitin, mag work back kana. Kung kailangan mo siya sa June, as early as February patakbo kana ng mga papers.*

SUC 3 Participant 3: *I think also that one of the positive attributes among IGP implementers is the ability to think and act in advance. We conduct meeting and we plan in advance, so we address and find mitigation measure to all problems in the operation.*

SUC 5 Participant 1: *One of the practices that we also do is, we plan our activities and we conduct regular meetings para ma address agad yung needs ng project.*

These statements imply that planning and working in advance is one of the characteristics that every IGP implementers must manifest to contribute to project sustainability. This means that when project managers are planning for the project in advance, they can anticipate potential issues in the project and find potential solutions to address these issues which contributes to project sustainability. This agrees with the study of Toperesu (2010) who discovered that planning ahead of time has helped in handling income generating activities by increasing the capacity of those who are involved in the project.

2.Supporting Decisions with Consultation Data. Costumer and stakeholder consultation provides substantial data that every manager should consider in planning and making decisions for the improvement of project implementation. This is one of the practices applied by the implementers in SUC 2 and 3 which served as one of the secrets contributing to their projects' sustainability. Hereunder are some of the statements of the participants:

SUC 2 Participant 3: *I would like to add into that, I think one of the practices that we also do is ensuring that all decisions we make are based on consultations. We value the feedbacks of our customers, and we use this to make decisions and plan for our project. and to improve our operations.*

SUC 3 Participant 2: *I think one of the best practices that we do as implementers is ensuring that all our decisions and actions were based on the needs of our clients, and we do consultation before we make our decisions and implement our plans and put it into action.*

These statements imply that IGP decision-making in all aspects of the IGP should be supported with data. This means that implementers should value consultation to determine the actual needs of the project. When implementers support every decision in the IGP operation with consultation data, this results to optimum performance of the IGP operation and contributes to project sustainability. This is aligned with the study of Vanhoucke (2018), who discovered that using a data-driven project management technique allows project managers to plan, monitor, and control projects while completing them on time and on budget.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Based on the FGD data, there are four (4) subthemes that emerged under best practice in IGP in terms of monitoring which includes effective planning, effective inventory scheme, excellent record keeping procedure and excellent accounting procedures. Implementers also shared on the policy compliance, feedback utilization, and open communication under best practices in IGP process and outcomes evaluation. Further, the IGPs will not be able to function without the necessary materials and equipment. In this regard, implementers' procurement and supply management procedures play a critical role in ensuring that the resources required to keep the IGP running. Under best procurement and supply management, prompt procurement and resourcefulness are also being practiced. Lastly, to guarantee that project policies are defined and executed to achieve sustainability, project governance and program management are critical. This means that the implementers' leadership style, professional attributes, and entrepreneurial talents must all be taken into account, as they play a critical part in the project's overall operation and success. Managers' values, planning and working ahead of time, and supporting decisions emerged from the FGD data under best practices in governance and program management.

With these results, it is good to note that income-generating activities provide additional benefits that reduce poverty; improve the wellbeing of communities; and promote empowerment, self-reliance and community development (Mehra, 1997). Thus this study recommends, that ZamBaSulTa SUCs best practices may be replicated especially for SUCs who do not have yet their IGPs and could serve as their benchmark. It is also recommended that extension programs should focus among the youngest members of the communities because many studies proved that early childhood education and intervention yield many long-term benefits for children. Studies, such as one by Harvard, have shown how early childhood education programs can prepare children to develop the social and emotional skills they need to succeed and graduate high school.

References

- Adora, N., & Ultra, C. (2020). Management evaluation of income generating projects of SUCs In Eastern Visayas, Philippines. Retrieved from <http://psychologyandeducation.net/pae/index.php/pae/article/view/3159/2807>
- Allen, M., Brown, P., & Finlay, B. (1994) Helping children by strengthening families. Washington, DC: Children's Defense Fund.
- Balduck, A., & Buelens, M. 2008. A two-level competing values approach to measure nonprofit organizational effectiveness. *Working Papers of Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, Ghent University, Belgium.*
- Bermejo, M. (2006). Management and operation of the Central Luzon State University College income generating projects, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Institute of Graduate Studies, Central Luzon State University, Science City of Munoz, Nueva Ecija, pp. 33-34.
- Blas, R. (2019). Income Generating Projects of Bulacan Agricultural State College: An Assessment. Retrieved from <https://www.ijer.net/archive/v8i10/ART20201875.pdf>
- Borges de Araújo, M., Alencar, L., & Miranda Mota, C. (2017). Project procurement management: A structured literature review. Retrieved from

- https://www.researchgate.net/publication/313012361_Project_procurement_management_A_structured_literature_review
- Bucata, G., & Rizescu, M. (2017). The Role of communication in enhancing work effectiveness of an organization. Retrieved from 148
- https://www.researchgate.net/publication/316360042_The_Role_of_Communication_in_Enhancing_Work_Effectiveness_of_an_Organization
- Chambers, R. and Conway, G. (1992) Sustainable rural livelihoods: Practical concepts for the 21st century. IDS Discussion Paper 296, IDS, Brighton.
- CHED (1997), Higher Education Modernization Act of 1997.
- Clark, A., & Oswald, A., (2000). Is job satisfaction u-shaped in age? *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology*, 69, 57-81.
- <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8325.1996.tb00600.x>
- Eid, M. (2009). Sustainable development and project management. Lambert Academic Publishing, Cologne.
- Eyben, R. (2010). Good Practice note on natural resource management and Empowerment. Unpublished
- Florendo, F. (2005). Income generating projects and institutional development of selected State Universities and Colleges in Luzon: implications to policy formulation. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Technological University of the Philippines, Manila, March, p. 64.
- Freeman, R. (2005). The development of stakeholder theory: An idiosyncratic approach. In K. Smith and M. A. Hitt (eds.), *Great Minds in Management*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 417-435.
- Gareis, R., Huemann, M., Martinuzzi, A. (2009). Relating sustainable development and project management. *Berlin: IRNOP IX*.
- IFAD (2011). IFAD strategic framework 2007-2010. Rome. Sustainability of rural development projects.
- IFAD (2012). IFAD's Approach to Sustainability: Strategic Framework 2007-2010. Rome. *Sustainability of rural Development projects*.
- IISD (International Institute for Sustainable Development). 2003. *Basics and issues* Available: <http://www.iisd.org/sd/> (accessed 26 March 2004).
- Jones, G. & Garforth, C. (1997). The history, development, and future of agricultural extension; In: B. Swanson, R. Bentz and A. Sofranko (eds.), *Improving Agricultural Extension: A Reference Manual*. FAO. Rome
- Karna, S., & Junnonen, J. (2005). Project feedback as a tool for learning. Retrieved https://www.researchgate.net/publication/252067846_Project_feedback_as_a_tool_for_learning
- Locklear, E., Riley, D., Steinberg, J., Todd, C., Junge, S., & McClain, I. (1994). Preventing problem behaviors and raising academic performance in North Carolina children: The impacts of school age child care programs supported by the University Extension Service. Raleigh, NC: North Carolina Cooperative Extension Service.
- Locklear, E. (1992). The impact of the 4-H system manager training on child care provider's perceptions of quality school-age child care. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC.
- Mullins, J. (2008). *Marketing Management*. 6th Edition, McGraw-Hill, New York, 2008.
- Mutimba (2013). Determinants of sustainability of donor funded projects: The case of selected projects in Ganze constituency in Kilifi County, Kenya. School of business. University of Nairobi.
- Nandamuri, P. (2013). 2013 Entrepreneurial Resourcefulness - Is it a Function of Gender? Nandamuri, P.P. © Business Frontiers Vol. 3, No. 1. 1 Entrepreneurial Resourcefulness - Is it a Function of Gender? . Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/268936709_Entrepreneurial_Resourcefulness_-_Is_it_a_Function_of_Gender

- National Association of Elementary School Principals. (1993). Standards for quality school-age child care. Alexandria, VA: National Association of Elementary School Principals.
- Norton B. (2010). Sustainability: A philosophy of adaptive ecosystem Management. Chicago: University.
- Oakley, P., & Garforth, C. (1997). *Guide to extension training*. Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.
- Omukoba, H., Simatwa, E., & Ayodo, T. (2011). Contribution of income generating activities to financing secondary school education in Kenya: A case study of Eldoret municipality. *Education Research*, 2(2), 884-897.
- Posner, J., & Vandell, D. (1999). After-school activities and the development of low-income urban children: A longitudinal study. *Developmental Psychology*, 35(3), 868–879. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0012-1649.35.3.868>
- Schermerhorn, J., Hunt, J., Osborn, R. & Osborn, R. (2004). *Core concepts of organizational behavior*: John Wiley & Sons Inc
- Soska, T., & Butterfield, A. (2013). University-community partnerships: Universities in civic engagement: Routledge.
- TANGO International (2008). Sustainability of rural development projects: Best practices and lessons learned by IFAD in Asia. The eighth in a series of discussion papers produced by the Asia and the Pacific Division, IFAD
- Toperesu, E. (2010). Effects of the income generating activities project on the Livelihood of volunteer care givers and on their service delivery to HIV/AIDS Affected households; a case of sedze cluster in Chitsanza ward, Zimbabwe. Retrieved from <https://edepot.wur.nl/167098>
- Tucson, A.& Tembo, F. (2010). Participation, Negotiation and Poverty. Encountering the Power of Images. England. Ashgate.
- Vanhoucke, M. (2018). The Data-driven Project Manager. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324052098_The_DataDriven_Project_M